

ONLINE APPENDIX

for

Government Privatization and Political Participation:
The Case of Charter Schools*

Jason Cook

University of Pittsburgh
Department of Economics
jbc50@pitt.edu

Vladimir Kogan

Ohio State University
Department of Political Science
kogan.18@osu.edu

Stéphane Lavertu[†]

Ohio State University
John Glenn College of Public Affairs
lavertu.1@osu.edu

Zachary Peskowitz

Emory University
Department of Political Science
zachary.f.peskowitz@emory.edu

September 8, 2018

*Note: The Spencer Foundation provided generous funding for this study.

[†]The authors are listed in alphabetical order. Please direct communications to the corresponding author at lavertu.1@osu.edu.

A Validity Checks

Table A1. Odd-year Validity Checks - 1999-2011

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|------------|------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|--------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| | ln(ChildPop) | ln(ChildPop) | ln(Pop) | ln(Pop) | ln(TPSenroll) | ln(TPSenroll) |
| Charters | -0.0091*** (0.0021) | 0.0034 (0.0032) | -0.0067*** (0.0017) | 0.0013 (0.0023) | -0.025*** (0.0031) | -0.0078** (0.0038) |
| <i>N</i> | 1847 | 1521 | 1847 | 1521 | 1847 | 1521 |
| Ratings | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Trends | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Candidates | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Districts | 265 | 264 | 265 | 264 | 265 | 264 |

Note: The dependent variables are logged counts of school-age children within district boundaries (columns 1-2), logged population within district boundaries (columns 3-4), or logged counts of students in traditional public schools (columns 5-6). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

Table A2. Odd-year Validity Checks – 1999-2005

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|------------|------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| | ln(ChildPop) | ln(ChildPop) | ln(Pop) | ln(Pop) | ln(TPSenroll) | ln(TPSenroll) |
| Charters | -0.0091*** (0.0021) | 0.0011 (0.0010) | -0.0034*** (0.0011) | 0.0026* (0.0016) | -0.016*** (0.0045) | -0.0085** (0.0043) |
| <i>N</i> | 1847 | 799 | 1053 | 799 | 1053 | 799 |
| Ratings | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Trends | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Candidates | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |

Note: The dependent variables are logged counts of school-age children within district boundaries (columns 1-2), logged population within district boundaries (columns 3-4), or logged counts of students in traditional public schools (columns 5-6). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

Table A3. Odd-year Validity Checks – 2005-2011

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|------------|-----------------------|-------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| | ln(ChildPop) | ln(ChildPop) | ln(Pop) | ln(Pop) | ln(TPSenroll) | ln(TPSenroll) |
| Charters | -0.018*** (0.0051) | -0.011 (0.010) | -0.0080** (0.0037) | -0.0057 (0.0079) | -0.024*** (0.0034) | -0.0079*** (0.0030) |
| <i>N</i> | 1058 | 946 | 1058 | 946 | 1058 | 946 |
| Ratings | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Trends | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Candidates | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |

Note: The dependent variables are logged counts of school-age children within district boundaries (columns 1-2), logged population within district boundaries (columns 3-4), or logged counts of students in traditional public schools (columns 5-6). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

Table A4. Even-year Validity Checks – 1999-2011

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|------------|----------------------|--------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---------------------|----------------------|
| | ln(ChildPop) | ln(ChildPop) | ln(Pop) | ln(Pop) | ln(TPSenroll) | ln(TPSenroll) |
| Charters | -0.0035* (0.0021) | 0.0012 (0.0010) | -0.0031* (0.0017) | 0.00042 (0.00057) | -0.012* (0.0060) | -0.00080 (0.0015) |
| <i>N</i> | 1586 | 1586 | 1586 | 1586 | 1586 | 1586 |
| Ratings | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Trends | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Candidates | No | No | No | No | No | No |

Note: The dependent variables are logged counts of school-age children within district boundaries (columns 1-2), logged population within district boundaries (columns 3-4), or logged counts of students in traditional public schools (columns 5-6). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

Table A5. Even-year Validity Checks – 1999-2005

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|------------|--------------|--------------|-----------|-----------|---------------|---------------|
| | ln(ChildPop) | ln(ChildPop) | ln(Pop) | ln(Pop) | ln(TPSenroll) | ln(TPSenroll) |
| Charters | -0.0035* | -0.00022 | -0.0011** | -0.00011 | -0.0049** | -0.0023 |
| | (0.0021) | (0.00023) | (0.00049) | (0.00027) | (0.0020) | (0.0022) |
| <i>N</i> | 1586 | 792 | 792 | 792 | 792 | 792 |
| Ratings | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Trends | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Candidates | No | No | No | No | No | No |

Note: The dependent variables are logged counts of school-age children within district boundaries (columns 1-2), logged population within district boundaries (columns 3-4), or logged counts of students in traditional public schools (columns 5-6). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

Table A6. Even-year Validity Checks – 2005-2011

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|------------|--------------|--------------|----------|---------|---------------|---------------|
| | ln(ChildPop) | ln(ChildPop) | ln(Pop) | ln(Pop) | ln(TPSenroll) | ln(TPSenroll) |
| Charters | -0.019*** | -0.011 | -0.0074 | -0.0022 | -0.023*** | -0.014*** |
| | (0.0071) | (0.019) | (0.0057) | (0.016) | (0.0041) | (0.0037) |
| <i>N</i> | 794 | 794 | 794 | 794 | 794 | 794 |
| Ratings | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Trends | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Candidates | No | No | No | No | No | No |

Note: The dependent variables are logged counts of school-age children within district boundaries (columns 1-2), logged population within district boundaries (columns 3-4), or logged counts of students in traditional public schools (columns 5-6). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

B Election Outcomes and Voter Characteristics

Table B1. Odd-year Election Outcomes – 1999-2011

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|----------|---------------------|------------------|---------------------|------------------|-------------------|-------------------|
| | CandPer | CandPer | VoteShare | VoteShare | Return | Return |
| Charters | -0.00019 (0.016) | 0.029 (0.026) | -0.0030 (0.0069) | 0.012 (0.015) | 0.011 (0.0068) | 0.0027 (0.015) |
| <i>N</i> | 1521 | 1521 | 1355 | 1355 | 1837 | 1837 |
| Ratings | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Trends | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |

Note: The dependent variables are counts of candidates per seat (columns 1-2), the vote share of incumbents running for re-election (columns 3-4), and the fraction of board members with expiring terms who return (columns 5-6). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

Table B2. Odd-year Voter Characteristics

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|----------|-----------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| | Liberal | LowIncome | Black | Teacher | Parent | Under40 |
| Charters | -0.00024 (0.00022) | -0.00031 (0.00070) | -0.0015 (0.00093) | -0.000095 (0.000090) | -0.00053 (0.00071) | -0.00035 (0.00035) |
| <i>N</i> | 1480 | 1480 | 1480 | 1480 | 1480 | 1480 |
| Ratings | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Trends | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |

Note: The dependent variable is the share of liberal votes (column 1), low income voters (column 2), voters who are black (column 3), voters who are teachers (column 4), voters who are parents (column 5), and voters under the age of 40 (column 6). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

C Effect Heterogeneity

Table C1. Effect Heterogeneity: Votes Cast in School Board Elections, 1999-2011

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|----------|-------------------|--------------------|-------------------|--------------------|---------------------|--------------------|
| | ln(V/Seat) | ln(V/Seat) | ln(V/Seat) | ln(V/Seat) | ln(V/Seat) | ln(V/Seat) |
| Charters | -0.026 (0.020) | -0.0032 (0.017) | -0.035 (0.021) | -0.0086 (0.018) | -0.058** (0.028) | -0.0088 (0.020) |
| <i>N</i> | 762 | 759 | 746 | 775 | 801 | 720 |
| Subset | LowAchieve | HighAchieve | HighPoverty | LowPoverty | HighBlack | LowBlack |
| Ratings | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Trends | No | No | No | No | No | No |

Note: The dependent variable is the log of total votes cast per open school board seat. Each pair of columns identifies districts that are above or below the median on the district performance index (median = 0.9387), in terms of the proportion of students who qualify for free lunch (median = .1536925), and in terms of the proportion of kids who are Black (median = .0126087). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates.*
 $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

Table C2. Effect Heterogeneity: Votes Cast in School Board Elections, 1999-2011

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|------------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|------------------|-------------------|-------------------|
| | ln(V/Seat) | ln(V/Seat) | ln(V/Seat) | ln(V/Seat) | ln(V/Seat) | ln(V/Seat) |
| Charters | -0.027 (0.030) | 0.0083 (0.027) | -0.040 (0.031) | 0.036 (0.024) | -0.050 (0.044) | -0.017 (0.036) |
| <i>N</i> | 762 | 759 | 746 | 775 | 801 | 720 |
| Subset | LowAchieve | HighAchieve | HighPoverty | LowPoverty | HighBlack | LowBlack |
| Ratings | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Trends | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Candidates | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |

Note: The dependent variable is the log of total votes cast per open school board seat. Each pair of columns identifies districts that are above or below the median on the district performance index (median = 0.9387), in terms of the proportion of students who qualify for free lunch (median = .1536925), and in terms of the proportion of kids who are Black (median = .0126087). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates.*
 $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

Table C3. Effect Heterogeneity: Voter Turnout in Odd-year Elections, 2001-2011

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|----------|------------|-------------|-------------|------------|------------|------------|
| | ln(Voters) | ln(Voters) | ln(Voters) | ln(Voters) | ln(Voters) | ln(Voters) |
| Charters | -0.016* | 0.023 | -0.019** | 0.019 | -0.023** | -0.00085 |
| | (0.0089) | (0.019) | (0.0088) | (0.015) | (0.011) | (0.014) |
| <i>N</i> | 737 | 743 | 749 | 731 | 755 | 725 |
| Subset | LowAchieve | HighAchieve | HighPoverty | LowPoverty | HighBlack | LowBlack |
| Ratings | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Trends | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |

Note: The dependent variable is the log of total voters scaled by the adult population. Each pair of columns identifies districts that are above or below the median on the district performance index (median = 0.9387), in terms of the proportion of students who qualify for free lunch (median = .1536925), and in terms of the proportion of kids who are Black (median = .0126087). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates.* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

Table C4. Odd-year Election Outcomes for Districts with Low-Achieving Students

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
|----------|---------|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|---------|
| | CandPer | CandPer | VoteShare | VoteShare | Return | Return |
| Charters | 0.0028 | -0.00039 | -0.00094 | 0.039** | 0.013 | 0.022 |
| | (0.018) | (0.029) | (0.0083) | (0.015) | (0.0082) | (0.015) |
| <i>N</i> | 762 | 762 | 683 | 683 | 912 | 912 |
| Ratings | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| Trends | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes |

Note: The dependent variables are counts of candidates per seat (columns 1-2), the vote share of incumbents running for re-election (columns 3-4), and the fraction of incumbents who return to the board the following year (columns 5-6). All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates.* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

D Additional Analyses

Table D1. Repeat Voters in Even Years

| | (1) | (2) | (3) |
|---|----------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| | ln(Repeat) | ln(Repeat) | ln(Repeat) |
| <i>Charters</i> | -0.00027 (0.0056) | -0.0030 (0.0060) | -0.0027 (0.012) |
| <i>Charters</i> _{<i>t</i>+1} | 0.0031 (0.0039) | 0.0010 (0.0040) | -0.014 (0.012) |
| <i>Charters</i> _{<i>t</i>-1} | -0.00090 (0.0034) | -0.0065 (0.0050) | -0.0023 (0.0033) |
| <i>Odd * Charters</i> | | | 0.023 (0.018) |
| [<i>Odd * Charters</i>] _{<i>t</i>+1} | | | 0.023 (0.016) |
| [<i>Odd * Charters</i>] _{<i>t</i>-1} | | | 0.0063 (0.0099) |
| <i>N</i> | 738 | 738 | 1476 |
| Ratings | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Trends | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Years | Even | Even | All |

Note: The dependent variable is the number of voters who also voted in the previous election. All models include commuting-zone-by-year and district fixed effects. Standard errors clustered by district are in parentheses below the coefficient estimates.* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$